Minutes of the Annual General Meetings (AGMs) of The Cochrane Collaboration, Collaboration Trading Company Limited and Cochrane Innovations Limited held in Auckland, New Zealand, on 1 October 2012

[These minutes were approved on 21 September 2013.]

Present: Entity representatives, Steering Group members, centrally funded staff; other contributors to The Cochrane Collaboration, and observers. (See Appendix 1 for the list of those present, and apologies received).

- 1. Welcomes, apologies for absence, and approval of the agenda

 Jonathan Craig, Co-Chair of the Steering Group, welcomed everyone to the meeting. He
 particularly welcomed Mark Wilson to the position of the Collaboration's Chief Executive Officer,
 which he would take up on 12 November 2012. No apologies for absence had been received in
 addition to those listed in the Appendix. The agenda was approved.
- 2. Steering Group membership changes

website.

- 2.1 Outgoing members: Jonathan thanked the outgoing members of the Steering Group, namely, Gail Higgins (TSC representative) and Sophie Hill (Co-ordinating Editor representative), for their many and varied contributions and hard work during their term as Steering Group members/trustees of the Collaboration. Jonathan also formally thanked Nick Royle, former Chief Executive Officer, who had left the Collaboration in January 2012, and Jon Deeks who had resigned as a Director of the Collaboration Trading Company with effect from this meeting. Jonathan introduced the current Steering Group members, and the incoming two new members, Marina Davoli (Co-ordinating Editor representative) and Michelle Fiander (TSC representative). Action: Jini Hetherington to update the records at Companies House.
- **2.2** Reappointment of Co-Chair: Jonathan explained that Jeremy Grimshaw had accepted to fulfil a further two-year term as Co-Chair, with effect from this meeting. No other candidates had been nominated for this position, and the Steering Group had approved Jeremy's reappointment.
- **2.3** The Collaboration's centrally funded staff: Jonathan showed photographs of the centrally funded staff (the Cochrane Operations Unit, the Cochrane Editorial Unit, the IMS Development Team, the Web Team, the two Training Co-ordinators (providing cover during the incumbent's maternity leave), and the Marketing and Public Relations Officer. There was a round of applause for the members of staff in expression of appreciation for their hardworking contributions to the organisation.
- 3. Approval of minutes of the previous Annual General Meetings of The Cochrane Collaboration and the Collaboration Trading Company Limited

 Steve McDonald proposed the approval of the minutes of the previous AGMs held in Madrid on 20 October 2011, Rachel Churchill seconded the motion, and the minutes were approved. They should be made available on the Collaboration website.

 Action: Jini Hetherington to arrange for the approved minutes to be available on the
- 4. Trustees' Report and Financial Statements for the year ended 31 March 2012

 These documents had been circulated to all Cochrane entities with 21 days' notice of this meeting. Mary Ellen Schaafsma thanked those who had assisted her in carrying out her responsibilities as Treasurer. Mary Ellen gave a presentation which highlighted the Collaboration's financial position with high level information from the audited Financial Statements and provided a brief overview of anticipated spending in the next financial year (see Appendix 2).

She proposed approval of the trustees' report and financial statements for the previous financial year; Mona Nasser seconded the proposal, and the motion was carried. Mary Ellen would sign the documents after this meeting on behalf of the Trustees, for submission to Companies House. **Action: Mary Ellen Schaafsma to sign the documents; Jini Hetherington to file them at**

5. Re-appointment of auditors, Mazars LLP

Julian Higgins proposed the reappointment of Mazars as the Collaboration's auditors, and Sally Bell-Syer seconded the proposal; the motion was carried. Mazars should be advised.

Action: Jini Hetherington to advise Mazars of their re-appointment.

6. Approval of accounting policies

Companies House.

Denise Thomson proposed approval of the Collaboration's accounting policies; Liz Whamond seconded the proposal, and the motion was carried. Mazars should be advised.

Action: Jini Hetherington to advise Mazars of approval of the accounting policies.

7. Collaboration Trading Company Limited: change of Director

Lorne Becker had advised that Jon Deeks had recently resigned as Director of the Collaboration Trading Company Limited, and Donna Gillies (a former member of the Steering Group/Trustee and Treasurer) had accepted to replace him.

Action: Jini Hetherington to notify Companies House.

8. Cochrane Innovations Limited: new Director

Jonathan explained that a second trading company had been established to diversify the Collaboration's funding streams. Lorne Becker had advised that the Steering Group had approved the appointment of Karen New as a Director of the second trading company. It was pointed out that both trading companies were wholly owned by the Collaboration.

Action: Jini Hetherington to notify Companies House.

This concluded the formal part of the AGMs, thus fulfilling the legal requirements governing charities registered in the UK.

9. Co-Chairs' report

Jeremy Grimshaw gave a verbal report on behalf of himself and Jonathan Craig. He highlighted some of the year's achievements and thanked the centrally funded staff for their part in this. The Colloquium sponsorship policy had been tightened up recently. The proposal to establish Cochrane Academies had been moved forward under the new title of the *Cochrane Initiative to Build Global Capacity in systematic reviews*, and Jeremy encouraged engagement in and support for this initiative (with units in Asia, Africa and South America). The International Development Research Centre (IDRC) had also expressed an interest in working with the Collaboration in this area. There would be a meeting in Beijing at the end of October 2012 with the aim of achieving sustained funding to extend this initiative. Jeremy gratefully acknowledged Peter Tugwell's contribution.

The work on developing the vision for, and then securing, the Collaboration's future publishing arrangements had taken a great deal of time, with widespread consultation, led by the Future Publishing Arrangements Project (FPAP) Project Board (Lucie Binder, Jonathan Craig, Sally Green, Jeremy Grimshaw, Julian Higgins, Harriet MacLehose, Charlotte Pestridge (specialist publishing consultant), Mary Ellen Schaafsma, Prathap Tharyan and David Tovey). The Project Board had been supported by Cathleen Blackburn, a lawyer specialising in publishing law, and other consultants with expertise in database and web technology.

A Request for Proposals (RFP) had been prepared for general release in May 2012 with the aim of seeking proposals to publish *The Cochrane Library* and associated products from January 2014, when the contract with our current publisher, John Wiley & Sons Limited (Wiley) was to expire. However, in April 2011, Wiley submitted to the Board an early 'pre-tender' offer. This offer

proposed substantially increased financial and human resource investment on the part of Wiley, increased financial return for the Collaboration, and a programme of technology and publishing services improvements.

Following a period of assessment, the Project Board requested and received the Steering Group's approval to suspend the release of the RFP in order that detailed discussions with Wiley could be undertaken, aimed at entering into a new, re-defined publishing contract based on the pre-tender offer and subsequent negotiations between the parties. The Board held the view that should these discussions be successful, maintaining a business relationship with Wiley would be the best option for the Collaboration in the coming years, providing better outcomes than could be achieved with an alternative publishing partner. In forming this view, they had considered the goals of the FPAP, which were to appoint a publisher to:

- 1. Work with the Collaboration to ensure that it maximised its impact on healthcare decision-making globally;
- 2. Ensure long-term financial sustainability for the Collaboration;
- Provide high-quality, flexible and innovative delivery solutions for Cochrane content;
- 4. Develop a successful business relationship with the Collaboration.

The framework for the discussions was set out in a Memorandum of Understanding between the parties. By September 2012 these discussions had been concluded and a new contract had been developed, which met the needs of both parties and set out in detail the vision and provisions for the Collaboration's future publishing arrangements, framed by the goals of the FPAP. This contract formalised the terms agreed in the early offer and subsequent negotiation period, including mechanisms to strengthen the management of the parties' business partnership. It was presented to the Steering Group in September and approval was received to proceed to signature. However, days away from signing, the proceedings were suspended as the result of an unanticipated opportunity proposed by a third party, which both the Collaboration and Wiley agreed merited further consideration before the new contract could be signed. Jeremy explained that the process of exploring this opportunity would take several weeks to conclude before any further announcement to the Collaboration would possible. He apologised for not being able to provide more detail at that point, highlighting the need for confidentiality while the exploration process took place. He also reiterated the Steering Group's commitment to achieving the Collaboration's goals of ensuring the widest possible access to, and use of, Cochrane Reviews and the other resources published in The Cochrane Library.

Jeremy concluded his report by once again expressing his thanks to Nick Royle for his many contributions to the Collaboration as Chief Executive Officer (CEO). Paul Farenden had been Acting Interim Director since Nick's departure in January 2012, and Jeremy acknowledged and thanked Paul for his involvement. Paul would remain in post until Mark Wilson took over as CEO in mid-November 2012. Jeremy explained the thorough process that had been undergone in recruiting a new CEO. Mark described his background and experience, and said he was thrilled to have the opportunity to work with the members of the Collaboration to further its aims.

10. Editor in Chief's report

David Tovey described some recent staff changes in the Cochrane Editorial Unit (CEU), and gave an assessment of the past year's progress. He described how the strategic session in Paris in April 2012 had led to a detailed plan for the future direction of the CEU's work. Standards of conduct and reporting had been developed and were now ready for implementation. David paid tribute to the hard work of the CEU staff; also to the Wiley team in this collaborative venture. Eighteen review groups were now actively using the Cochrane Register of Studies. David paid tribute to Amy Drahota, Caroline Struthers and Marialena Trivella for their hard work in the area of training. He also said there had been some refinements to the Monitoring and Registration Committee's processes. David referred to *Cochrane Library* usage figures in his presentation (see Appendix 3), and explained that the system for providing feedback on Cochrane Reviews had been improved. He referred to the reviews that had been highlighted in the preceding year.

David thanked Richard Smith and the Cochrane Library Oversight Committee for their help and support. A 'publish when ready' model would be achieved in the near future. Support for Review Groups would continue in the coming year, and steps would be taken to improve support via the MaRC, and to improve accessibility and readability. Jonathan expressed thanks to David for his leadership, and also acknowledged Wiley's many contributions and collaborative approach.

11. Questions and Answers

Jonathan invited questions and comments on any aspect of the Collaboration's activities, which would be posted on the cochrane.org discussion forum. Questions posted in advance on the forum would also be answered: http://www.cochrane.org/forum/collaboration-questions/2012-annual-general-meeting-any-question-any-topic.

Chris Mavergames and Nancy Owens of the Web Team asked a two-part question: the first part referred to Recommendation 26 of the Strategic Review, which was to 'Develop an ongoing and participatory approach to strategy formation': Chris asked what initiatives the Steering Group had put in place to implement this recommendation. Nancy followed up by saying that the Web Team would like to explore technological solutions to support the integration of this recommendation into Cochrane processes and to engage widespread participation and transparency including focusing use of the Community area on cochrane.org and engaging with the Cochrane Content Publication and Development Programme. Chris and Nancy offered to prepare a paper outlining suggested strategies for consideration by the Steering Group. Jonathan welcomed this offer and thanked them for volunteering to take forward the Recommendation in this way.

Action: Chris Mavergames and Nancy Owens to prepare a proposal to the Steering Group.

Karsten Juhl Jørgensen from the Nordic Cochrane Centre asked how the 4 million GBP reserves indicated in the Financial Statements would be used. Jonathan said that, during the last five years as the Collaboration's income had increased, the Steering Group had followed a cautious spending strategy in order to build reserves and ensure the Collaboration's financial stability. This had put the organisation in a strong financial position, which over the next five years would allow for increased investment in the centrally funded infrastructure, whilst maintaining a financial safety net for the organisation. A strengthened central infrastructure would be used to support Cochrane groups and contributors worldwide better in their work, to innovate, and to increase the Collaboration's global impact. The incoming CEO would provide vision and leadership in achieving these aims.

Gerd Antes from the German Cochrane Centre said he felt that there was a harmful trend in the Collaboration towards being less inclusive of those whose first language was not English. He was under the impression that the Translation Working Group, for example, was predominantly comprised of people whose first language was English and asked how this trend could be reversed. (It was later clarified to Gerd that the Translation Working Group is predominantly comprised of people whose first language is not English).

Jonathan Craig responded by stressing the importance with which the Steering Group regarded this global organization's attempts to provide global impact, its initiatives around translation, and its intention to build synthesis across the globe. David Tovey pointed out that translation had been an important focus for the past 3-4 years, with the inclusion of both producers and publishers of reviews in languages other than English. The 'Translation Exchange' had been a fantastic step forward in enabling publication of reviews in as many languages as possible. High priority had been given to encouraging the inclusion of as many translated reviews as possible in as many languages as possible. Plain language summaries and abstracts of reviews were now published in *The Cochrane Library* in several languages, and the Collaboration continued to demonstrate its strong commitment in this area. Jeremy Grimshaw encouraged Collaboration contributors globally to get more involved in the running of the organisation, for example, by standing for election to the Steering Group. However, it was recognized that translation and global participation were priorities, and more should and would be done.

Robert Wolff, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews, asked about co-operation with guideline groups and whether this could be done with Health Technology Assessment institutes. David said that agreements were being sought with several guideline groups. He agreed with Robert about the potential for creating guidelines with HTA groups, and he was keen to do more in this area. Robert also suggested including Cochrane Reviews in HTA documents as a measure of impact. David welcomed this suggestion but said that no action had been taken in this regard, mainly because the CEU did not have as strong links with HTA organisations as with guideline groups. He thanked Robert for his suggestion and undertook to follow it up.

Action: Lucie Binder to post the questions and answers on the website.

Jonathan then showed a slide of the Collaboration's vision, namely, "that healthcare decision-making throughout the world will be informed by high-quality, timely research evidence. We will play a pivotal role in the production and dissemination of this evidence across all areas of health care." He said that this vision persisted, and that the year ahead included increased support for the CEU, working with the new CEO, signing a new publishing contract, and celebrating the Collaboration's twenty year anniversary throughout 2013. Jonathan hoped that alternative funding sources would be identified, our monitoring processes would be improved, and stronger partnerships would be formed. He said that we all belonged to a single Collaboration working for mutual aims. Change would be required, leaders of the future should be developed, and our brand should be strengthened to achieve greater global impact.

12. Prizes and Awards:

- 12.1 Chris Silagy Prize 2012: Martin Janczyk and Juliane Ried had been the joint recipients of the 2011 Prize. Martin and Juliane presented the 2012 Prize to Jordi Pardo Pardo for having made "an extraordinary contribution to the work of the Collaboration" exceeding the expectations of their employment, which would not be recognised outside the scope of this Prize. Jordi had been identified by his peers as consistently contributing to a spirit of collaboration.
- **12.2 Bill Silverman Prize 2012:** Jeremy Grimshaw presented the prize on behalf of David Moher, chair of this year's selection panel to Mona Nasser and co-authors Vivian Welch, Peter Tugwell, Erin Ueffing, Jodie Doyle and Elizabeth Waters, for their publication, 'Ensuring relevance for Cochrane reviews: evaluating processes and methods for prioritizing topics for Cochrane reviews' (doi:10.1016/i.iclinepi.2012.01.001).
- **12.3 Kenneth Warren Prize 2012:** Jonathan Craig presented the prize on behalf of Martin Meremikwu, chair of the 2012 selection panel, to Don P Mathanga, author with the Cochrane Infectious Diseases Group, for the Cochrane Review, 'Intermittent preventive treatment regimens for malaria in HIV-positive pregnant women', co-authored with Olalekan A Uthman and Jobiba Chinkhumba, published on *The Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews* in *The Cochrane Library* (doi: Issue 10. Art. No. CD006689. DOI: 10.1002/14651858.CD006689.pub2.). The selection criteria for the Prize were being improved with effect from 2013 and would be made available on the website in due course.
- **12.4** Anne Anderson Award 2012: Unfortunately, no call for nominations had been made this year and the funds would therefore be carried over to 2013.
- 12.5 Special award for the most cited and most accessed Cochrane review
 Cindy Farquhar described this special award by the organising committee of the 20th Cochrane
 Colloquium, for the most cited and most accessed Cochrane review, 'Interventions for preventing
 falls in older people living in the community'. This review had been co-authored by Lesley
 Gillespie, Clare Robertson, William (Bill) Gillespie, Catherine Sherrington, Simon Gates, Lindy
 Clemson and Sarah Lamb, of the Cochrane Bone, Joint and Muscle Trauma Group. Cindy
 presented the award to Bill and Lesley, who said a few words in thanks.

Jonathan Craig thanked everyone for attending, and drew the meeting to a close at 5.15 p.m.

Appendix 1

Entity representatives who attended the AGM on 1 October 2012

Entity Name Entity representative

Cochrane Centres (14)

Australasian Cochrane Centre Brazilian Cochrane Centre Canadian Cochrane Centre Chinese Cochrane Centre **Dutch Cochrane Centre** French Cochrane Centre German Cochrane Centre Iberoamerican Cochrane Centre Italian Cochrane Centre Nordic Cochrane Centre South African Cochrane Centre South Asian Cochrane Centre **UK Cochrane Centre**

Sally Green Maria Regina Torloni Lisa McGovern Jing Li Pauline Heus Isabelle Boutron Christine Schmucker **Gerard Urrutia** Roberto D'Amico Karsten Juhl Jørgensen

Joy Oliver Prathap Tharvan Martin Burton Kay Dickersin

Cochrane Fields (12)

US Cochrane Center

Child Health Field Complementary Medicine Field Consumer Network **Developing Countries Field** Health Care of Older People Field

Justice Health Field Neurological Field **Nursing Care Field**

Pre-hospital and Emergency Care Field

Primary Health Care Field

Rehabilitation and Related Therapies Field

Vaccines Field

Lisa Hartling Eric Manheimer Catherine McIlwain

Apologies Tracey Howe

Catherine Gallagher Maria Grazia Celani

Alan Pearson Patricia Jabre Bruce Arroll **Apologies Apologies**

Cochrane Methods Groups (16)

Adverse Effects Methods Group Agenda and Priority Setting Methods Group

Applicability and Recommendations Methods Group

Bias Methods Group

Campbell and Cochrane Economics Methods Group Campbell and Cochrane Equity Methods Group Comparing Multiple Interventions Methods Group

Individual Participant Data Meta-analysis Methods Group

Information Retrieval Methods Group Non-Randomised Studies Methods Group Patient Reported Outcomes Methods Group

Prognosis Methods Group

Prospective Meta-Analysis Methods Group Qualitative and Implementation Methods Group Screening and Diagnostic Tests Methods Group

Apologies

Sandy Oliver

Holger Schunemann

Lucy Turner Ian Shemilt Peter Tugwell Tianjing Li Lisa Askie Carol Lefebvre **Barnaby Reeves** Donald Patrick Carl Moons Lisa Askie Jane Noyes Yemisi Takwoingi

Joanne McKenzie

Cochrane Review Groups (53)

Acute Respiratory Infections Group

Airways Group Anaesthesia Group

Back Group

Bone, Joint and Muscle Trauma Group

Breast Cancer Group Childhood Cancer Group Colorectal Cancer Group

Consumers and Communication Group Cystic Fibrosis and Genetic Disorders Group Dementia and Cognitive Improvement Group Depression, Anxiety and Neurosis Group

Developmental, Psychosocial and Learning Problems Group

Drugs and Alcohol Group

Ear, Nose and Throat Disorders Group

Effective Practice and Organisation of Care Group

Epilepsy Group

Eyes and Vision Group Fertility Regulation Group Gynaecological Cancer Group Haematological Malignancies Group

Heart Group

Hepato-Biliary Group HIV/AIDS Group Hypertension Group Incontinence Group Infectious Diseases Group

Inflammatory Bowel Disease and Functional Bowel

Disorders Group Injuries Group Lung Cancer Group

Menstrual Disorders and Subfertility Group Metabolic and Endocrine Disorders Group

Methodology Review Group Movement Disorders Group

Multiple Sclerosis and Rare Diseases of the Central Nervous

System Group

Musculoskeletal Group

Neonatal Group

Neuromuscular Disease Group Occupational Safety and Health Group

Oral Health Group

Pain, Palliative and Supportive Care Group Peripheral Vascular Diseases Group

Pregnancy and Childbirth Group

Prostatic Diseases and Urologic Cancers Group

Public Health Group

Renal Group

Schizophrenia Group

Sexually Transmitted Infections Group

Skin Group Stroke Group

Tobacco Addiction Group

Liz Dooley Emma Welsh Mathew Zacharias

Apologies Lesley Gillespie

Melina Willson Apologies

Henning Andersen Megan Prictor Alfonso Iorio Sue Marcus Sarah Dawson

Geraldine Macdonald Roberto d'Amico Martin Burton Denise O'Connor Graham Chan Anupa Shah

Apologies Clare Jess Nicole Skoetz

Apologies

Dimitrinka Nikolova

Joy Oliver Jim Wright

Muhammad Imran Omar

Apologies

Katie Le Blanc
Apologies
Ivan Solà
Helen Nagels
Bernd Richter
Philippa Middleton

Apologies

Apologies

Rachel Buchbinder

Roger Soll Apologies

Kaisa Neuvonen Anne Littlewood

Apologies Apologies Lynn Hampson

Apologies

Elizabeth Waters Narelle Willis Prathap Tharyan Hernando Gaitan Laura Prescott

Maree Hackett

Apologies

Steering Group members

Sally Bell-Syer
Rachel Churchill
Jonathan Craig (Co-Chair)
Marina Davoli (incoming member)
Michelle Fiander (incoming member)
Jeremy Grimshaw (Co-Chair)
Gail Higgins (outgoing member)
Julian Higgins
Sophie Hill (outgoing member)
Steve McDonald
Mona Nasser
Mary Ellen Schaafsma (Treasurer)
Denise Thomson
Liz Whamond
Mingming Zhang

Centrally funded staff

A. Cochrane Editorial Unit staff (London, UK)

Jackie Chandler, Methods Co-ordinator Ruth Foxlee, Information Specialist John Hilton, Editor Toby Lasserson, Senior Editor Harriet MacLehose, Senior Editor David Tovey, Editor in Chief

B. Cochrane Operations Unit staff (Oxford, UK)

Claire Allen, Deputy Administrator
Lucie Binder, Project Support and Business Communications Officer
Jini Hetherington, Administrator and Company Secretary
Catherine McIlwain, Consumer Co-ordinator
Mark Wilson, incoming Chief Executive Officer (from 12 November 2012)

C. IMS Team (Copenhagen, Denmark)

Henrik Helmø Larsen, System Developer Jacob Riis, Communication and Support Officer Jessica Thomas, IMS Team Manager

D. Web Team (Freiburg, Germany)

Martin Janczyk, Programmer and Web Publisher Chris Mavergames, Director of Web Development Nancy Owens, Content and Social Media Editor

E. Training Co-ordination (Australia and UK)

Miranda Cumpston (**Apologies**: maternity leave) Caroline Struthers, Interim Training Co-ordinator Marialena Trivella, Interim Training Co-ordinator

Communication and Public Relations (Ottawa, Canada)

Lori Tarbett

Collaboration Trading Company Limited Donna Gillies, Director

Rob Scholten, Director

Cochrane Innovations Limited

Lorne Becker, Director Karen New, Director Juliane Ried, Project Officer

* * * * * * * * *

Appendix 2

Treasurer's report

Appendix 3

Editor in Chief's report